
From »Give Us Friends« to »Other Sheep I Have«: Transnational Friendship and Edinburgh 1910*

von Dana L. Robert

Zusammenfassung

Der folgende Aufsatz unterscheidet sich von den meisten anderen Beiträgen zur Weltmissionskonferenz von Edinburgh (1910), die meist von den Texten, der Botschaft, den Reden und den Protokollen des Ereignisses handeln. Er richtet einen mikroskopischen Blick auf die Gastfreundschaft, die einige im Women's Missionary College (St. Colm's) der Vereinigten Freikirche von Schottland untergebrachten Konferenzteilnehmer erlebten. Ausgehend von einer Rede des jungen indischen Theologen V.S. Azariah, der für eine über die Grenzen von Rassen, Klassen und Kulturen hinausgehende Freundschaft warb, erzählt die Autorin von dem Beispiel der Delegaten – unter ihnen auch Azariah –, die in jenem Institut untergekommen waren und so während der Dauer der Konferenz die Freundschaft pflegen konnten, zu welcher der junge Inder aufgerufen hatte. Ein trauriges Ende der Geschichte ist, dass St. Colm's geschlossen wurde, kurz nachdem Dana Robert selbst anlässlich der Hundertjahrfeier der Konferenz im Jahr 2010 dort Aufnahme gefunden hatte.

Schlüsselbegriffe

→ Weltmissionskonferenz (1910)
→ Women's Missionary College (St. Colm's)
→ Transnationale Freundschaft
→ V.S. Azariah
→ Postkoloniale Reflexion

Abstract

The paper, in contrast to most other research regarding the missionary conference in Edinburgh 1910 which mostly concentrates on the documents, message, speeches, and minutes of the event, gives a microcosmic view of the hospitality rendered to Asian conference participants being housed in the Women's Missionary College of the United Free Church of Scotland, called St. Colm's. Starting from a conference speech by the young Indian theologian V.S. Azariah who called for friendship beyond the borders of races, classes, and cultures, she tells the example of then delegates including Azariah who made friends across cultural and gender boundaries in the context of staying at St. Colm's. A sad end of the story was that St. Colm's was closed shortly after Robert herself had been accommodated there at the occasion of attending the centennial conference in 2010.

Keywords

→ World Missionary Conference (1910)
→ Women's Missionary College (St. Colm's)
→ transnational Friendship
→ Rev. V.S. Azariah
→ postcolonial reflection

Sumario

El artículo se diferencia de la mayoría de las otras contribuciones sobre la Conferencia de la Misión Mundial en Edimburgo (1910), que normalmente tratan de los textos, del mensaje, de las alocuciones y las actas del acontecimiento. Dirige una mirada microscópica a la hospitalidad, que experimentaron algunos participantes a la conferencia en el Women's Missionary College (St. Colm's) de la Iglesia Libre Unida de Escocia. Partiendo de una alocución del joven teólogo indio V.S. Azariah, que proponía una amistad por encima de las fronteras de las razas, las clases y las culturas, la autora habla del ejemplo de los delegados – entre ellos también de Azariah –, alojados en aquel instituto y que durante la conferencia pudieron cultivar la amistad a la que había invitado el joven indio. Un triste final de la historia es que se cerró St. Colm's poco después de que la misma Dana Robert con motivo de la celebración del centenario de la conferencia 2010 hubiera estado alojada allí.

Palabras clave

→ Conferencia de la Misión Mundial (1910)
→ Women's Missionary College (St. Colm's)
→ amistad transnacional
→ V.S. Azariah
→ reflexión postcolonial

The World Missionary Conference at Edinburgh in 1910 is considered the symbolic beginning of the modern ecumenical movement, especially among Protestants. Over twelve hundred representatives of Protestant missionary societies from Europe and the United States gathered in Edinburgh. Participants included those from European state churches, evangelical free churches, and high church Anglicans. Roman Catholic Bishop Geremia Bonomelli sent a letter of greeting. Following the conference, Chairman John Mott set out on a world tour to organize twenty-one councils of missions and churches in Asia. Delegates returned to home churches energized in favor of new forms of interdenominational cooperation. A Continuation Committee under conference Secretary Joseph H. Oldham founded the International Missionary Council, which over the next half century played a crucial role in defending religious freedom, in communicating among missionary societies of different nationalities, and in holding major conferences to discuss mission theology and policy. The World Missionary Conference both represented a high point for cooperation among nineteenth-century missionary societies, and laid the foundation for what is now called World Christianity.¹

In retrospect, interpretations of the conference emphasize its colonialist nature. The 1910 meeting occurred at the peak of worldwide European expansion, when much of Asia and most of Africa had been carved into European spheres of control and influence. Some of the discussions criticized colonialism, but most of the conference proceedings assumed it – or even considered it a handmaid to world evangelization. Although they gave a disproportionately high number of speeches, only twenty delegates, less than 2 %, were from the majority world.² Nine of the twenty were from India. Women, including wives, composed the majority of missionaries on the »foreign mission field,« yet only 207 or 16 % of the delegates were women.

Lending support to the interpretation of Edinburgh 1910 as a colonialist enterprise was arguably the most memorable speech of the event, delivered by a young Indian cleric, the Rev. V. S. Azariah. He proclaimed:

»The exceeding riches of the glory of Christ can be fully realized not by the Englishman, the American, and the Continental alone, nor by the Japanese, the Chinese, and the Indians by themselves – but by all working together, worshipping together, and learning together the Perfect Image of our Lord and Christ. It is only ›with all the Saints‹ that we can ›comprehend the love of Christ which passeth knowledge, that we might be filled with all the fullness of God.‹ This will be possible only from spiritual friendships between the two races. We ought to be willing to learn from one another and to help one another. Through all the ages to come the Indian Church will rise up in gratitude to attest the heroism and self-denying labours of the missionary body. You have given your goods to feed the poor. You have given your bodies to be burned. We also ask for *love*. Give us FRIENDS!«³

* This paper was delivered October 6, 2017 at the joint meeting of the Deutschen Gesellschaft für Missionswissenschaft (DGMW) and the Internationalen Instituts für Missionswissenschaftliche Forschung (IIMF) in Muenster, Germany. It was developed from chapter two of an unpublished manuscript tentatively entitled *Transnational Friendships and Fellowship in the Making of World Christianity, 1889–1939*. The original research for the article was done with the support of The Historical Society, and their Templeton-funded project, Religion and Innovation

in Human Affairs. I am grateful to Prof. Don Yerxa, head of RIHA, and also to the Henry Luce III Fellowship program for the sabbatical during which I finalized the paper. I thank Rev. Bobby Anderson and Fiona Anderson for their generosity in hosting me at St. Colm's in June of 2010, and providing me access to the archives then housed there.

1 The best source on the World Missionary Conference is Brian STANLEY, *The World Missionary Conference, Edinburgh 1910*, Grand Rapids/Cambridge 2009.

2 For the list of foreign delegates, see STANLEY, *World Missionary Confer-*

ence (fn. 1), 23. Stanley overlooked at least one Asian delegate, the Anglo-Indian Grace Stephens. On Grace Stephens, see Dana L. ROBERT, *Faith, Hope, Love in Action: United Methodist Women in Mission Yesterday, Today, and Tomorrow*, Address to Mission Forward Symposium April 19, 2010, St. Louis, Mo.: <http://www.unitedmethodistwomen.org/what-we-do/transformative-education/mission-study/social-issues/joy-to-the-world/united-methodist-women-in-mission-yesterday,-today> (accessed July 14, 2017).

3 V. S. Azariah, quoted in STANLEY, *World Missionary Conference* (fn. 1), 125.

Azariah's plea for friendship between races criticized the paternalism and condescension that often characterized relationships between colonizers and the colonized. Even when they visited British missionaries in their homes, Azariah and other Indian Christian leaders could not be sure they would be invited to sit down. In remarks omitted from the conference report, Azariah reportedly said, »Too often you promise us thrones in heaven, but will not offer us chairs in your drawing rooms.«⁴

The audience greeted Azariah's words with tense silence. Then most delegates applauded. Some objected. Historical evidence points to the probability that American leaders encouraged Azariah to speak his mind. Even so, the speech provoked response from the chair and a rump meeting to address its explosive potential.⁵ By accusing his colonial sponsors of classism and racism, the young Indian cleric pointed to the elephant in the room. His call for friendship across race, class, and cultures jolted European missionaries who felt they deserved more respect. After all, they had traveled far from their home countries and sacrificed their lives for the conversion and uplift of others.

This historic speech has rightly been remembered for its accusation of missionary hypocrisy, even amid the impressive accomplishments of Edinburgh 1910. But from a post-colonial perspective, Azariah's speech also marked a milestone in the history of unfolding international relationships. His speech claimed a shared vision of transnational, interracial and multi-cultural Christian community. Within this shared framework, he challenged the delegates of Edinburgh 1910 to live up to the values of the Kingdom of God. This vision included equality among people of all races, united through what he called »spiritual friendships« in Jesus Christ.

In this paper, I explore one of the assumptions behind Azariah's call for friendship – namely, a missional matrix of transnational relationships. Practices of friendship emanated from a robust, multicultural internationalism shared by Asian delegates and some of the western women and male missionaries at the conference. These friendships provide a broader framework in which to situate Azariah's speech, and they move beyond the anti-colonial discourse to which it is usually confined.

The paper consists of three parts. First, I will briefly situate my research in the context of postcolonial reflection. Second, in the main part of the paper, I will explore the transnational friendships in which Azariah's speech was imbedded. And finally, I will conclude by arguing more generally for the significance of friendship as a hidden component in the shaping of twentieth century mission history and World Christianity.

4 Ibid., 124; H.A. POPLEY, KT Paul, Christian Leader, Calcutta 1938, 41.

5 STANLEY, World Missionary Conference (fn. 1), 126-127.

6 Definitions of postcolonialism range from historians' use of the term to denote the period of time following the relinquishment of European colonies, to literary theorists' use of the term to reject a Eurocentric »grand narrative,« and to interrogate the meaning of ideas and events from within the framework of local, indigenous agency. See Duncan IVISON, Postcolonialism. Historical Period, in: Encyclopedia Britannica: <https://www.britannica.com/event/postcolonialism> (accessed July 16, 2017). Leela GANDHI, Postcolonial Theory: A Critical Introduction, New York 1998.

7 GANDHI, Postcolonial Theory (fn. 6), 4-5.

8 Whether hidden voices of women and the poor can be retrieved is another point of debate. See Gayatri CHAKRAVORTY SPIVAK, Can the Subaltern Speak?, in: Cary NELSON / Lawrence GROSSBERG (eds.), Marxism and the Interpretation of Culture, London 1998, 271-313.

9 Eleonora Dorothea HOF, Reimagining Mission in the Postcolonial Condition: A Theology of Vulnerability and Vocation at the Margins, Utrecht 2016, 61.

10 For a definition of entanglement theory as used by European historians see https://www.uni-bielefeld.de/cias/wiki/e_Entangled_History.html (accessed September 12, 2017).

1 Postcolonial frameworks and transnational friendship

By introducing practices of friendship as a factor in mission history, I interrogate from a postcolonial perspective the relational dimensions of Azariah's call to »Give us FRIENDS!« Traditional interpretations of early twentieth century mission history prioritize western culpability and colonial guilt. Such approaches, as important as they are, still keep the western missionary experience at the center of the story of Edinburgh 1910. A postcolonial approach, however, provides new insights by expanding the range of historical actors, and broadens the questions beyond what is readily available from written speeches and official conference reports.

Definitions of postcolonialism vary widely.⁶ In general, however, postcolonial readings do not obliterate the memory of colonialism. Rather, as Leela Gandhi puts it, »The forgotten archive of the colonial encounter narrates multiple stories of contestation and its discomfiting other, complicity.«⁷ Postcolonial readings challenge the binary of the racist westerner versus the romanticized, nonwestern other. It opens up new interpretive spaces in which »hybridity« flourishes, and where the historical actors give and take from each other, across the constructed boundaries of nationality, race, gender, and social class, while still taking seriously the hegemonic power dynamics inherent within colonial structures. In this paper, examination of friendship practices across cultural boundaries reveals hidden perspectives of those who lacked full voices at Edinburgh 1910, such as women delegates and students, and Asian Christians.⁸

Postcolonial approaches have a positive role to play in mission history. Eleanora Hof argues that a postcolonial perspective allows the construction of a missiology of vulnerability and marginality. In terms of its use in mission history, she calls for it to »retrieve the perspective and the (oral) histories of what transpired in the contact zone between missionaries and local agency.«⁹ This paper hints at a missiology of marginality through reference to »Other sheep I have,« identified by women and Asian delegates as a counterpoint to the conference itself.

I show in this paper how practices of friendship grounded Azariah's speech in a multicultural international framework. Examining friendship practices allows the historian to probe beneath the overt colonial context of both the Edinburgh 1910 conference, and of Azariah's formal call to »Give us FRIENDS!« It facilitates what German historians call »entanglement,« the writing of history from an interactive global perspective.¹⁰ I would argue that the subject of transnational friendship provides a microcosm of what historians call entangled history. Taking a postcolonial or entanglement approach allows me to ask such questions as: How did Azariah's call for friendship reflect the shared identity of Asian delegates at the conference and their western missionary allies? How did issues of class, race, and gender play into the call for friendship? And finally, why was friendship so important that it needed to be named by Azariah in the setting of Edinburgh 1910?

2 Practices of Friendship and »Other Sheep I Have«

2.1 Azariah's Transnational Networks

In calling for friendship between races, Azariah spoke out of his own hybrid, transnational identity. He was part of both Indian and western missionary worlds; this means that he was also caught between them. He was a bridge between cultures, but not fully accepted in either. As a minority Christian, and an Anglican at that, he was not accepted as a patriotic Indian by Muslims and Hindus. Neither was he a European. His experience was similar to that of the other Asian delegates at Edinburgh 1910, who came from cultures in which Christians were often despised as sell-outs to colonialism.

Azariah was a second generation Christian from Tamil Nadu, who had grown up attending missionary boarding schools.¹¹ Thus it is important to note that Azariah's call for friendship reflected not only the experiences of Indian Christians in a colonial context, but some of their missionary partners as well. He lived in a »third space« defined by friendship and partnership between Indians and westerners, who saw their personal relationships as a witness to the true values of the Kingdom of God, against the racial exclusion both of British missionary life and of Hindu caste-ism.¹² For missionaries in that third space, Azariah's speech verbalized what they had come to understand through hard years of personal experience – that witness to Christ involved neither condemnation nor coercion, but the cultivation of mutual relationships with others unlike themselves. These missionaries embraced friendship as authentic missionary practice. John Small, for forty years a Free Church of Scotland missionary in Poona, counseled, »Be a good listener ... Loving friendship with those you meet is of unspeakable value ... It is the Spirit of Christ in us that does the true work, not our own toil.«¹³ Robert Hume, a famous India missionary who contributed to the World Missionary Conference study on other religions, wrote that »The first word of the Gospel is the word Brother, never the word Sinner, nor even the word Christ, as is sometimes imagined.«¹⁴

By the time of the World Missionary Conference, the growing momentum to articulate a philosophy of Christian friendship had taken on great urgency, especially among Christian workers trying to reach the growing numbers of secularizing, college-educated Asian youth. The British Raj had ruled India for over fifty years, with a century of domination by the British East India Company before that. Hard on the heels of unpopular policies imposed by Lord Curzon, Viceroy of India, national anger boiled over. In February of 1905, Curzon made a particularly tactless speech that implicitly accused Indians of being liars and basically unfit for self-government.¹⁵ Relationships between Indians and Europeans deteriorated dramatically. As YMCA secretary, the Scot J. N. Farquhar noted from his post in Bengal, »I have never before seen one quarter of the wild agitation and anger that are now apparent in this city and province.«¹⁶ Virtually overnight, it seemed, Christian missionaries in India were seen as oppressors, and Indian Christians as traitors to Mother India. Farquhar himself was struck by a brick while trying to rescue some missionary belongings from an angry mob.

Thus it was amid the tension between the internationalist perspective of Christian missions, and growing Indian nationalism, that young V. S. Azariah pursued cross-cultural friendships – opportunities he found within the Student Christian Movement. In 1905 he partnered with fellow YMCA worker, American evangelist Sherwood Eddy, to found the National Missionary Society of India. This group soon sent young Indian

11 Susan BILLINGTON HARPER, *In the Shadow of the Mahatma*. Bishop V. S. Azariah and the Travails of Christianity in British India, Grand Rapids/Richmond 2000.

12 Definitions of »third space« vary from postcolonial use for a zone in which hybridity or cultural mixing takes place, to missiological use as a liminal space beyond the walls of the church, in which encounters between Christians and non-Christians can take place. Post-colonial use of »third space« is attributed to Homi K. BHABHA, *The Location of Culture*, London/New York 1994.

13 John SMALL, quoted in Isabel LUSK, »A Thoroughly Furnished Woman: Annie Small and the Training of Women Missionaries, unpublished paper delivered, Edinburgh 1994, 13. St. Colm's International House Archives. For a description of the archives previously stored at St. Colm's, see <http://www.mundus.ac.uk/cats/48/1015.htm>.

14 Robert HUME, quoted in Kenneth CRACKNELL, *Justice, Courtesy and Love: Theologians and Missionaries Encountering World Religions*, 1846–1914, London 1995, 202.

15 Eric SHARPE, *Not to destroy but to fulfil: the contribution of J. N. Farquhar to Protestant missionary thought in India before 1914*, Lund 1965, 210–219.

16 J. N. FARQUHAR, quoted in SHARPE, *Not to destroy but to fulfill* (fn. 15), 216.

17 Sherwood EDDY, *Pathfinders of the World Missionary Crusade*, New York/Nashville 1945, 139.

18 BILLINGTON HARPER, *In the Shadow of the Mahatma* (fn. 11), 55–62.

missionaries to evangelize five different parts of the country. In so doing, it countered the popular accusation that Christianity was a foreign religion. In contrast to most interactions between westerners and Indian Christians, Eddy and Azariah's personal relationship developed into one of complete equality.¹⁷ They traveled together through South India, preaching in Tamil to students and visiting YMCA chapters to stimulate missionary commitment among them.¹⁸ Eddy later wrote that Azariah was one of the five most Christ-like people he had ever known,» whose »priceless friendship« over fifteen years of intimate partnership was extremely important to him both personally and professionally.¹⁹

In 1906 Azariah extended his transnational networks to a pan-Asian Christian perspective when he accompanied two Japanese YMCA leaders through India for a speaking tour. In the wake of recent Japanese victory over Russia, crowds greeted them with enthusiasm. Then in 1907 Azariah represented Indian Christianity at both the World Student Christian Federation meeting in Tokyo, and the Fifth National Convention of the YMCA's of China, Korea, and Hong Kong. In each of these venues he worked alongside other young Asian Christian leaders. For example, one of the Japanese he accompanied in India was Tasuku Harada, with whom he also attended the WSCF meeting in Tokyo, and the 1910 World Missionary Conference. His relationship with fellow Asian Christians no doubt inspired him when Azariah argued for a distinctly Asian indigenous missionary movement: Japanese Christians should evangelize Japan, Chinese should evangelize China, and Indians should evangelize India. »Drawing our inspiration from the cross, let us go forth to make Jesus King of Asia.«²⁰

By the time he goaded the missionaries with his dramatic plea at Edinburgh 1910, the Indian priest had already experienced the possibilities of Christian friendship within the international fellowship of the Student Christian Movement. Azariah's call for friendship was based on the untapped potential of Christian internationalism as a potent force to transform the world.²¹ He was also an active Indian missionary who was calling western fellow missionaries to task for treating him as an outsider. The social aspects of the conference experience encouraged the potential for boundary-crossing friendships among Christians from around the world, in contrast to actual conditions on the mission field. As the *Madras Christian Patriot* reported from the World Missionary Conference, »Racial difference was absolutely lost in a glowing sense of brotherhood of aim and spirit. And quite apart from the influence of the discussions in the conference, these tea-table talks under the evening sky have cemented international friendships and opened floodgates of sympathy.«²²

19 Sherwood EDDY, *A Pilgrimage of Ideas, or The Re-Education of Sherwood Eddy*, New York 1934, 95-96, 216.

20 Azariah, quoted in BILLINGTON HARPER, *In the Shadow of the Mahatma* (fn. 11), 43.

21 The concept of internationalism was an important framework for developing world unity and civil society during the first half of the 20th century. Mainline Protestant missionaries and indigenous Christian leaders shared commitment to Christianity as a source of global unity among persons of different nationalities, but interpre-

tations of the meaning of Christian internationalism varied widely. More comparative research is needed in this area. See Dana L. ROBERT, *Christian Transnationalists, Nationhood, and the Construction of Civil Society*, in: Donald YERXA (ed.), *Religion and Innovation: Antagonists or Partners?*, London 2016, 141-156; Glenda SLUGA, *Internationalism in the Age of Nationalism*, Philadelphia 2013; Abigail GREEN/Vincent VIAENE (eds.), *Religious Internationals in the Modern World: Globalization and Faith Communities since 1750*, New York 2012.

22 »Every Race Represented,« *The Christian Patriot*, October 1, 1910, p. 4; quoted in: *Discourses of Indigenous Christian elites in colonial societies in Asia and Africa around 1900: a documentary sourcebook from selected journals*, edited by Klaus KOSCHORKE/Adrian HERMANN/E. PHUTI MOGASE/Ciprian BURLACIOIU, Wiesbaden 2016, 59.

2.2 Practices of Friendship and the Women's Missionary College

Another source of Azariah's poignant appeal for »spiritual friendships between the two races« lay just a mile and a half from the United Free Church of Scotland's Assembly Hall where the conference was meeting. After each day of speeches and deliberations, participants scattered across town to their lodgings. In an unprecedented show of hospitality, the citizens of Edinburgh had opened their homes to missionaries and church leaders from around the world. But not everyone stayed in a private home. Azariah joined nine other participants who daily trekked down the Mound toward the botanical gardens, to the Women's Missionary College of the United Free Church of Scotland, also known as St. Colm's. Opened just a year before, the impressive three-story stone residence contained small private rooms, shared parlors and common spaces, and a chapel on the first floor. The College was led by Miss Annie Small, formerly a missionary in Poona.

Delegates housed at St. Colm's included twenty percent of the nonwestern participants: Indian Anglican priest V.S. Azariah, Japanese Congregationalist President Tasuku Harada of Doshisho College; Chinese educator Prof. Jingan Dong of Shanghai Baptist Seminary; and Assamese Baptist evangelist Thang Khan Sangma. The only two white men housed at St. Colm's were Scottish Presbyterian India missionary Nicol Macnicol, an expert on popular Hinduism and leading scholar of Indian religions, and American Methodist China bishop James Bashford. Of the ten visitors who boarded at the College, four were women – another kind of »other« in the male-dominated ecclesial structures of 1910. Those who stayed at St. Colm's were Ruth Rouse of the Student Christian Movement, and Georgina Gollock of the Church Missionary Society, plus the non-delegate wives of Bishop Bashford and Nicol Macnicol. Thus eight of the ten boarding at the Women's Missionary College were at some level outsiders, either by virtue of their ethnic origin, their gender, or lack of status at the Conference itself. But when they left the conference each day and went home to St. Colm's, the minority became the majority. Counting the female residents of the college, women predominated. (Abb. 1)

The students of the Women's Missionary College lived in community while training for missionary service. They came from Scotland, England, and Ireland. As the reputation of the school grew, the geographic and denominational range of the students spread across Europe. Principal Miss Annie H. Small, well-known for her expertise in preparing missionaries for cross-cultural work, took advantage of the presence of distinguished visitors by cancelling regular classes. Each morning before breakfast, the residents and guests worshipped in the chapel, often led by India missionary Nicol Macnicol, conference delegate and old friend

23 Macnicol had followed John Small as a Free Church of Scotland missionary assigned to Poona. Thus he and Annie Small knew each other.

24 Visitors to St. Colm's during the World Missionary Conference were recorded in the Women's Missionary College guest book. The page of the registry for June 23, 1910, shows the signatures of the ten official guests. Other pages show that many women missionaries visited St. Colm's during the conference. Signatories included mission visitors from India, China, Japan, Manchuria, Hungary, Switzerland, Ireland, Wales, Calabar (Nigeria), Egypt, Mexico, the United States, Australia, Canada, Norway, Germany, Syria (Lebanon), France, New

Zealand, Holland, Java (Indonesia), Denmark, Sweden, South Africa, Burma (Myanmar), Congo, Turkey, South America, and numerous locations in England and Scotland. Unfortunately it is impossible to determine the extent of participation in St. Colm's activities afforded by the occasional visitors. See Guest Book, Women's Missionary College, World Missionary Conference, June 13 to 24, 1910. Archives, St. Colm's International House, Edinburgh.

from Poona.²³ The women of the college took turns sitting in the visitors' galleys and side meetings, listening to the debates over mission policy, and reporting to fellow students. Missionaries from around the world stopped in to see the innovative training institute.²⁴ In the evenings, students and the ten residential guests ate together in the dining room, conversing about conference proceedings and urgent issues in world missions.

On Thursday evening the last day of the conference, residents and guests gathered in the common room. The students planned to give their distinguished guests mementos of their time together--copies of their college hymn book and photographs of the chapel and students. But the visitors made the first move. Professor Dong had drawn attention at the Conference for being the only delegate to wear traditional Chinese dress. On behalf of the others, Dong gave formal thanks to the women for their hospitality. Then he presented them with a 1903 etching by Edinburgh artist William Hole, based on the bucolic painting »O'er Snow-clad Pastures,« by Joseph Farquharson, a noted Scottish landscape painter. Farquharson was known for his paintings of the Scottish countryside, especially his signature depictions of sheep on snow. The black and white etching depicted a flock of long-haired horned sheep in winter, grazing among the shadows of bare trees. (Abb. 2)

The guests nicknamed the picture »Other sheep I have,« after Jesus' words in John 10:16. »And other sheep I have, which are not of this fold: them also I must bring, and they shall hear my voice; and there shall be one fold, and one shepherd.« They attached to the frame a brass plaque engraved with »Other sheep I have,« and their names. (Abb. 3) Expressing shared gratitude for their home away from home, Methodist Bishop James Bashford of China referred to the etching and »spoke of the sheep following their Shepherd who is just out of sight.«²⁵

Mutual signs of appreciation abounded over the next few days. When it became apparent that the guests had mistakenly signed the student rather than visitors' page of the College registry, V.S. Azariah and Georgina Gollock expressed their delight »at being enrolled as students, and declared their intention of claiming all their privileges as such.«²⁶ On Sunday, President Harada of Doshisha College, who had addressed the Edinburgh Conference on the contribution of non-westerners to the world church, shared his perspectives on the history of Christianity in Japan.²⁷ After the last of the ten departed on Monday, the women residents of St. Colm's spent time together reflecting upon what they had learned from the interlude. The College scribe noted in their House Guild Letter, »Perhaps the greatest impression left upon our minds by the Conference is that it is not over yet. The spirit and power of the meetings will continue to influence an ever-widening circle; and a great step has been taken towards the realization of unity among the various branches of Christ's Church.«²⁸

25 »Extracts from House Guild Journal, June 10th to 27th 1910,« Women's Missionary College, House Guild Letter June 1910, 35, in: Archives, St. Colm's International House, Edinburgh, Scotland. After I consulted the archives at St. Colm's in 2010, they were subsequently moved to the National Library of Scotland <https://www.nls.uk/catalogues/online/cnmi/inventories/acc13301.pdf>.

26 Ibid., 36.

27 On the career of Tusuku Harada, and his role as bridge figure between east and west, see Masao OTA/George M. OSHIRO, Mediator Between Cultures: Tasuku Harada and Hawaiian-Japanese Intercultural Relations in the 1920s, in: The Hawaiian Journal of History 33 (1999) 171-201. <http://evols.library.manoa.hawaii.edu/bitstream/handle/10524/598/1/L33177.pdf?sequence=2> (accessed July 16, 2017).

28 »Extracts from House Guild Journal, June 10th to 27th 1910« (fn. 25), 38.



1

2



3

12
13 *MISSIONARY COLLEGE HYMNS:*
Hymn to Ahru Mazda.
Sing with reverence. Syrian.
By permission of Rev. W. H. T. Gairnes, Cairo.
(Adapted by A. H. S.)

1. We wor-ship the Spi-rit Di-vine, All wis-dom and goodness pos-sess-ing,
Sur-round-ed by Ho-ly Im-mor-tals, The giv-ers of bounty and blessing,
We joy in the work of His hands, His truth and His pow-er con-fess-ing.

2. We praise all the things that are pure,
For these are His only Creation;
The thoughts that are true, and the words
And deeds that have won approbation;
These are supported by Him
And for these we make atonement.

3. Hear us, O Mazda! Thou livest
In truth and in heavenly gladness;
Cleanse us from falsehood, and keep us
From evil, and bondage to sadness;
Pour out the light and the joy
Of Thy life on our darkness and sadness.

REV. HENRY VAN DYKE, D.D. From *The Other Wise Men*.
(By permission of the Author.)

14. *Ginezzin's Call to Prayer.*
This should be sung by a male voice (or voices), and if possible, from a distance. The
pauses should be emphasized. No accompaniment. Mohammedan.

ORIENTAL AND MISSIONARY. 13

God..... is great!
Al - la hu ak - bar.

I bear wit-ness there is no God but God.
As - hadu an - la il - la hu il - la il - la.

I bear wit-ness there is no God but God.....
As - hadu an - la il - la hu il - la.

I bear wit-ness Mu-ham-mad is the a-pos-tle of God.
As - hadu an - na Mu-ham-mad ar - ra - sul Ul - lah.

I bear wit-ness Mu-ham-mad is the a-pos-tle of
As - hadu an - na Mu-ham-mad ar - ra - sul Ul - lah.

God..... Come..... to prayer!
Hal - ya al - as al - ah.

Come..... to pray
Hal - ya al - as al - ah..... er!

Come..... to prayer! Come to al - wa-tion!
Hal - ya al - lah. Hal - ya al - al - fa-lah.....

God is great! God..... is great! There is no God but God!
Al - la hu ak - bar! Al - la hu ak - bar! La il - la hu il - la hu il - la.

4

1 Delegates housed at St. Colm's included twenty percent of the nonwestern participants.

2 Etching by Edinburgh artist William Hole, 1903, based on the bucolic painting »O'er Snow-clad Pastures,« by Joseph Farquharson.

3 The guests nicknamed the picture »Other sheep I have,« after Jesus' words in John 10:16. They attached to the frame a plaque engraved with »Other sheep I have,« and their names.

4 Annie Small's hymnal, and its Publication in 1914 as *Missionary College Hymns*.

2.3 The Message of »Other Sheep I Have«

The subversive message of »Other sheep I have« can be understood in the context of the World Missionary Conference itself. The gathering was big news. Famous missionaries and church leaders converged from around the world. Seventy to eighty members of the press from North America and Great Britain covered the events, including three from the *London Times*.²⁹ During the opening ceremonies, the densely-packed hall had rung with »All people that on earth do dwell,« one of the most beloved hymns of European Protestantism, commonly known as »Old Hundredth:«

»All people that on earth do dwell,
Sing to the Lord with cheerful voice ...
We are his folks, he doth us feed,
Sing to the Lord with cheerful voice ...

As a shepherd protected and fed his sheep, so did the Lord care for his people. Participants reported out of the conference to their constituencies. Missionaries in the most remote mission stations eagerly awaited first-hand accounts in denominational mission magazines. Around the world, those involved in the great task of missions participated in spirit, and rejoiced to be part of Jesus' own flock of followers.

The presentation of the etching »Other sheep I have« to the Women's Missionary College took place away from the spotlight after the conference closed. The incident was recorded only in the college diary. But naming the etching »Other sheep I have« shifted the foundations of the missionary movement away from European Protestantism. The first importance of the etching lay in who gave it – four Asian delegates, four western women of whom two were delegates, and two western male missionaries. »Other sheep« was a not very subtle metaphor for »outsider,« those whose pastures lay beyond the flock of European Christendom. In missionary circles, as a phrase it was sometimes used as shorthand for the missionary cause itself.³¹ Jesus the »Great Shepherd« had talked mysteriously about sheep »not of this fold,« possibly the Gentiles who nevertheless would be brought into unity with the Jewish followers already under his protection. Did »Other sheep I have« mean those yet to be evangelized? Or were the other sheep symbolic of a »missiology of marginality« – those who felt marginalized by the colonial overtones of the conference and so identified themselves as outsiders? Was »Other sheep I have« visibly represented by the foreign visitors themselves, proud Asian Christian leaders who symbolized the way of the future? As Anglican missionary Temple Gairdner wrote in the official summary of the conference, »But possibly the most interesting, certainly by far the most significant figures of all, were those of the Oriental and African delegates, yellow, brown, or black in race, that were scattered among the delegates in that World Conference. For not only by their presence but by their frequent contributions to the debates, they gave final proof that the Christian religion is now rooted in all those great countries of the Orient and the South.«³²

²⁹ STANLEY, *World Missionary Conference* (fn.1), 75.

³⁰ For the centennial celebration of the World Missionary Conference in Edinburgh 2010, the hymns sung at the original conference were reconstructed and printed on a handout. I have taken the wording of this hymn from the handout.

³¹ For example, the Church of the Nazarene mission magazine, founded around 1911-12, was entitled *The Other Sheep*.

³² W. H.T. GAIRDNER, »Edinburgh 1910«: An Account and Interpretation of the World Missionary Conference, Edinburgh/London 1910, 56-57: <http://archive.org/details/edinburgh1910ana/oogairuoft> (accessed August 14, 2012)

³³ The iconography of the stained glass reflected the international missionary aspirations of St. Colm's founders. »It depicts the Risen Christ crowned with the thorns and the laurel. Along the rocky paths are the rose of England, the shamrock of Ireland and the thistle of Scotland – representing the first students. The mountains of Africa and the temples

The giving and the receiving of »Other sheep I have« embodied the future of world Christian community. As a form of gift exchange, it represented an intercultural intersection, a precious moment of cross-racial and cross-gender understanding that was all too rare in the colonial world of 1910. The multivalence of the gift exchange was also revealed in the symbolism of the sheep. The Edinburgh artist who etched it, Bible illustrator William Hole, was the one who had designed the stained glass in St. Colm's chapel only a few years before – his only known work in stained glass. At the top was the college motto modified by Annie Small from John 10, »He calleth his own by name and leadeth them out, and they follow him for they know his voice.« The sheep who belonged to Jesus were both the missionaries who trained at St. Colm's and followed him into the world, and the foreign other sheep who were »not of this fold.«

The female recipients of »Other sheep I have« also hint at its deeper meaning. The women of the Missionary College reached out in friendship to the »outsiders« of the World Missionary Conference. In turn, the foreign visitors chose as a gift of appreciation an icon of Scotland, a depiction of Scottish sheep grazing the moors, and renamed it to reflect their own identity. In response to Scottish hospitality, the »other sheep« recognized their mutual missionary calling exemplified in the etching of the Scottish sheep. Ultimately the givers and the receivers were one flock, united and equal under their shepherd Jesus Christ.³³ Perhaps V.S. Azariah's image of the Englishman and American, the Chinese, Japanese and Indian »working together, worshipping together, and learning together« reflected the hospitality he was experiencing at St. Colm's.³⁴

D. Annie Small, Friendship, and *Missionary College Hymns*

The role of Principal Annie H. Small was key to understanding the role of St. Colm's as the place where missionary women and foreign guests met as equals in a shared home. Her belief in friendship shaped the home-like nature of the training institute. Miss Small had grown up the daughter of Scottish missionary John Small in Poona, India. She became a *zenana* worker – a missionary woman who visited secluded Muslim and Hindu women in their homes, and befriended them. For health reasons she returned to Scotland, and in 1894 became Principal of the Women's Missionary College. Similar to the *zenana* philosophy of personal visitation and relationship building, Small's pedagogical method for educating missionaries entailed the holistic formation of well-rounded character and intercultural listening skills. According to Small, a key purpose of practical training for future missionaries included »contact with human life ... and to practice in that contact the great lesson which our Lord Jesus came showing, that life, however apparently clouded, may be made bright through the gift of a simple human fellowship; and that it may be made radiant by the gift of the fellowship which He Himself offers, the fellowship of a Divine Fatherhood, and a Divine-Human Brotherhood.«³⁵ Living in spiritual, intellectual, and practical community was a hallmark of the educational model for which the College was known. The reputation of the institute was such that Miss Small was one of only four women members of the twenty-four person Commission V, »the Preparation of Missionaries.«³⁶ Photos of Commission V members show them posing outside St. Colm's.

Intercultural Christian worship embodied Annie Small's philosophy of missionary training. When foreign visitors came to St. Colm's, Small's students entertained them

of Asia represent the world to which the Gospel must be preached.« Jean FRASER, St. Colm's College Historical Notes 1887-1962, in: Friends of St. Colm's Newsletter. St. Colm's College Centenary, 1909-2009, Spring 2009, 9.

³⁴ V. S. Azariah, quoted in STANLEY, World Missionary Conference (fn. 1), 125.

³⁵ Annie H. SMALL, Our First Twenty Years, 1894-1913, in: A. H. SMALL / F. MACKENZIE / A. E. M. MOINET / H. MACNICOL, The Church of Scotland, Women's Missionary College, St. Colm's, Edinburgh: Memories of 50 Years 1894-1944, n.p. [1946], 20.

³⁶ World Missionary Conference, 1910, Report of Commission V: The Preparation of Missionaries, Edinburgh/London/New York 1910, ix-x.

by singing Indian and other Asian melodies that she had collected, arranged, and put to words. These intercultural experiments, however valuable the effort, were not entirely successful. Small wryly noted, »I have not forgotten the non-recognition by a Japanese friend of a common Japanese air as sung by us, nor the smiles with which our attempts to render some Egyptian music were received by friends from Egypt.«³⁷

The sojourn of the four nonwestern delegates at the College spurred the revision of Annie Small's hymnal, and its publication in 1914 as *Missionary College Hymns*. This hymnal was ahead of its time. It was one of the first to focus on Asian music for Christian worship. It included hymns and chants from Indian, Chinese, Japanese, Formosan, Persian, Egyptian, Syrian, German, Scottish, and Jewish traditions.³⁸ Even more astounding was that it contained a few chants of Vedic, Muslim, and Buddhist origin, and tunes from multiple Indian traditions – Marathi, Bengali, Hindustani, Hindi, Gujarati, and Sanskrit. After their return home, the Asian delegates sent contributions for inclusion in the new hymnal. President Harada of Doshisha in Japan sent at least three. Small's purpose in collecting and teaching nonwestern and non-Christian music to her students was to help them »understand and to sympathise with the inner character and thought of the peoples of Asia and Africa.«³⁹ The use of Asian music for missionary training inculcated attitudes of openness toward other cultures among the students, as well as created emotional bonds with foreign visitors. By its exotic nature, the performance of the music by the women of the College had the added benefit of attracting friends and donors in Great Britain.⁴⁰ (Abb. 4)

Annie Small's commitment to the »Other sheep I have« was not limited to hymnody and worship. She wrote short books on Islam, Buddhism, and Hinduism for use by Student Volunteer study groups. The most popular of these, reprinted multiple times, told the story of an Indian Brahman who through his own spiritual search for truth, and the testimony of indigenous Christians, found Jesus Christ the »Healer« without the mediation of a foreign missionary.⁴¹ The implicit message of *Yeshudas* was that Indian culture was capable of leading the »other sheep« to Christ without the imposition of western forms. Although Small's books were written for mission study, they showcased her basic commitment to intercultural understanding and to the attitudes that underlay fulfillment theory. The book on Islam, for example, concludes with the following: »Shall we talk the matter quietly over? Tell me of your Faith, and of what it means to you ; and will you give me also a hearing? Such an appeal rarely fails; and if Christ and His message be fairly introduced, the result may safely be left with Him.«⁴²

As Christianity increasingly became a multi-cultural global movement during the twentieth century, St. Colm's morphed from a woman's mission community to a hospitality house for international church visitors. The memory of the World Missionary Conference faded, but for a hundred years the etching of »Other sheep I have« maintained silent witness to a forgotten intersection of worlds and meanings.

37 Annie H. SMALL, compiler, *Missionary College Hymns*, Edinburgh / London c.1914, iii. A later work that references the groundbreaking nature of *Missionary College Hymns*, as an experimental hymnal entirely devoted to »missionary hymns,« was G. Currie MARTIN, *The Church and Hymn Writers*, London 1928, 217. Martin overlooked the unique nature of the non-western sources for the hymnal and

thus misrepresented its chief significance, perhaps because he misread the title as »Missionary Hymns« rather than hymns of the »Missionary College.« I am indebted to hymnologist Dr. Carl Daw for the reference to Martin.

38 SMALL, *Missionary College Hymns* (fn. 37), iv. Unfortunately no copies of the original hymnal survived. The earliest is the published version of 1914.

39 *Ibid.*, iii.

40 SMALL, *Memories of 50 Years* (fn. 35), p. 31.

3 The Significance of Transnational Friendship for Mission History

This case study of Azariah's call for spiritual friendship, in relationship to the concrete fellowship he experienced at St. Colm's, illustrates the central importance of actual practices of friendship in the history and theory of Christian mission. Usually when historians evaluate Edinburgh 1910, they look at the big speeches, the conference reports, the colonial context, and the launching of the 20th century ecumenical movement. This paper shows the importance of actual relationships among people as an important factor in interpreting the origins of the ecumenical Protestant mission movement.

What difference did it make for those who spent ten days in close association across gender and ethnic lines at St. Colm's? Although it is impossible to measure the impact of their experiences, one sees signposts of the multi-cultural fellowship that is now called World Christianity. After the conference, each person went his or her separate way, reabsorbed into all-encompassing ministries. The female students presumably finished their studies and went into various mission fields. Their time at St. Colm's occurred at a particular moment in history, after it became clear that women missionaries should be educated and formed in community, and before they could typically be admitted for degrees in theological seminaries. In 1912, Azariah was consecrated the only Indian bishop in the Church of England – a distinction maintained until after his death in 1945. Each person made his or her own contribution to the unfolding story of worldwide Christian fellowship.

For a precious ten days, Asians and women and a couple of western men lived as a community of equals at St. Colm's, a liminal space that embodied the vision of the multicultural Kingdom vision to which they all aspired. That their time at St. Colm's meant a lot to them was evident in the Asian delegates' effort to assist with the version of *Missionary College Hymns* published by Miss Small in 1914: they sent contributions of indigenous Asian music to add to her hymnal. In return, the memory of their presence was kept at St. Colm's for another century, as the etching remained on the wall and the story of »Other sheep I have« was passed down orally to new generations of students and visitors. To those in the know, its presence on the wall of the sitting room symbolized the prophetic power of cross-cultural friendship shared by Annie Small, the residents, and guests of the Women's Missionary College.

This case study shows the importance of transnational friendship as a postcolonial corrective to mission history as an unremitting onslaught of patriarchal colonialist oppression.⁴³ I have tried to show in this paper that the voices of Asians and women were not confined to their formal speeches recorded at the conference. Even though women were basically silent at Edinburgh 1910, their relationships in community were rich and generative. By living together for ten days, and practicing friendship across boundaries, the community

41 Annie H. SMALL, *Yeshudás. A Bond-Servant of Jesus*, Edinburgh/London 1907. Note that Jeshudas is a story of fulfillment theory, in which Christianity »fulfills« or makes full the potentialities in the convert's previous religion. For an exploration of the importance of fulfillment theory around 1910, see CRACKNELL, *Justice, Courtesy and Love* (fn. 14). Fulfillment theory was seen as a step forward

from the idea that a convert's previous religion needed to be destroyed before being replaced by Christianity.
42 Annie H. SMALL, *Islam*, London/New York 1905, 72.

43 Leela Gandhi discusses friendship as a factor in anti-imperialism, in her book: *Affective Communities: Anti-colonial Thought, Fin-de-Siècle Radicalism, and the Politics of Friendship*, Durham 2006. Although homosexuals rather than missionaries are her focus, she includes missionary C. F. Andrews in her analysis.

at St. Colm's presents an alternative interpretation of the Edinburgh 1910 conference. In their identification of »the Other Sheep« as a metaphor to describe themselves, the international group staying at St. Colm's hinted at a missiology of vulnerability.

Based on my research into friendship as a component of the mission experience in the first half of the twentieth century, I would argue that mission itself was an extremely important space in which cross-cultural relationships could be constructed.⁴⁴ Although friendship did not solve structural oppression or cure racism or colonialism, it witnessed against it. Were transnational friendships perfect? No, of course not. But those who worked in mission knew that they existed, even if documented only in the hearts of those loyal to each other.

This paper demonstrates the challenges of finding sources to document the history of boundary-crossing relationships. The difficulty of the research is one reason why scholars have ignored the impact of friendships for so long, and why postcolonial perspectives are useful in thinking about the subject. Friendships have been hidden under such formal theological language as cooperation, fellowship, internationalism, ecumenism, brotherhood, partnership, and the Kingdom of God. The scholar must look beyond conference reports and formal correspondence and seek out diaries, autobiographies, and other more personal sources in order to follow the friendship trail. Friendship consists of practices. It stays alive in oral memories. Friendship is seldom written down. Yet if you scratch below the formal speeches and the conference reports, there were usually concrete friendships underneath.

In June of 2010, I was honored to be the keynote speaker at Edinburgh 2010, the centennial celebration of the Edinburgh 1910 conference.⁴⁵ I was partly chosen because I am a woman: the organizers wished to correct the legacy of Edinburgh 1910 in which women were not keynote speakers. Because of the far-sighted vision of the organizers, I was housed at St. Colm's in the room of Annie Small. I was put there in memory of the fellowship between women and Asian delegates that occurred in 1910. While there, I conducted research on the college diaries and notes taken by the students at St. Colm's, and their guest registry, and other materials that documented their history. Sadly, in August of 2010, »Other sheep I have« was taken down off the wall. A mere two months after the centennial celebration of the World Missionary Conference in Edinburgh, due to church decline and the collapse of British interest in missions, Scottish Presbyterians closed St. Colm's.⁴⁶ Over a century of hospitality to ecumenical and multi-ethnic mission groups was gone. This paper, therefore, signifies both the importance of the documentation of cross-cultural friendship, and also its fragility.

And yet, as V. S. Azariah prophetically observed in 1910, cross-racial and cross-cultural friendship contained within it the seeds of universal fellowship, and even the Kingdom of God. In the lives of its most self-sacrificing practitioners, the transformational power of friendship was both personal and political. At the heart of friendship lay an enduring vision of global community. ♦

⁴⁴ See Dana L. ROBERT, *Cross-Cultural Friendship in the Creation of Twentieth-Century World Christianity*, in: *International Bulletin of Missionary Research* 35:2 (2011) 100-107; ID., *Global Friendship as Incarnational Missional Practice*, in: *International Bulletin of Missionary Research* 39:4 (October 2015) 180-184; ID., *Cross-Cultural Friendship and Mission: History and Practices*, Sprunt Lectures,

May 8-10, 2017, Union Presbyterian Seminary, Richmond, Virginia.
https://www.youtube.com/playlist?list=PLq1zKD6DFrpRVzToBlUnjqzHGksnB_kBx.

⁴⁵ Dana L. ROBERT, *Mission in Long Perspective*, in: Kirsteen KIM/Andrew ANDERSON (eds.), *Edinburgh 2010: Mission Today and Tomorrow*, Oxford 2011, 55-68.

⁴⁶ »Church sells off missionaries' college in bid to save money,« *The Scotsman*, May 20, 2010.
<http://www.scotsman.com/heritage/people-places/church-sells-off-missionaries-college-in-bid-to-save-money-1-1238050>
(accessed July 15, 2017).